

Captivating Cases in Rabbinic Responsa



JLI FLAGSHIP COURSE
WINTER 5786

OVERVIEW

From as early as the eighth century to the present, individuals and local rabbis have submitted legal inquiries to the leading decisors of Jewish law in their respective eras. These questions span every sphere of life—from business dealings to intimate personal matters—and encompass virtually all fields of law: financial, civil, criminal, torts, family, medical, and beyond.

The extant written responses form a comprehensive corpus of Jewish legal precedent, serving as a testament to the art of legal discernment. The reasoning employed by rabbis in applying ancient legal principles to concrete situations illustrates rigorous methods of fact-finding, interpretation of precedent, and balancing of competing values in pursuit of ethical and just decisions.

Captivating Cases in Rabbinic Responsa, a six-week OLE course from the Rohr Jewish Learning Institute (JLI), explores a representative selection from this vast repository of case studies—spanning continents and centuries—and compares their treatment with approaches found in U.S. law.

LESSON 1

DISPATCHES OF DEVOTION: ADHERENCE TO JEWISH LAW

This opening lesson introduces responsa literature and its role within the broader context of Jewish law, comparing its function to that of case law—or common law—in U.S. legal argument. We examine the dynamic relationship between common law and statutory law, highlighting how restatements and legal treatises systematize judicial decisions. A parallel process in Jewish law codifies rabbinic rulings for broader application.

We then analyze three case studies to illustrate rabbinic decision-making in practice. A compelling subtext emerges: the historical contexts reveal that responsa literature also serves as an unintended historical record of Jews' unwavering commitment to uphold Jewish law, even under the most trying circumstances.

LESSON 2

TORAH IN THE TRENCHES: FACT-FINDING IN LEGAL DECISION-MAKING

This lesson reviews responsa that demonstrate how Jewish law engages with real-world facts and scientific insight, bridging sacred texts with the complexities of lived experience.

Like judges in American courts, rabbis act as fact finders in reaching their rulings. Courts often rely on expert witnesses to provide professional opinions; similarly, rabbis consult recognized experts and, when necessary, go to great lengths to master the relevant science or mechanics at issue.

Responsa—which record both the facts and the reasoning underlying the decision—offer valuable insight into the prevailing scientific and professional understandings of their times, as well as into the daily realities of earlier centuries. Contemporary rabbis must assess whether prior rulings remain applicable in light of new scientific knowledge and modern conditions.

LESSON 3

PRECEDENT IN PRACTICE: PAST RULINGS APPLIED TO NEW REALITIES

Scientific innovation continually generates new legal quandaries. Jewish law responds by creatively drawing analogies from ancient paradigms to address novel developments.

In this lesson, we trace this application of legal reasoning in Jewish law—from the thirteenth-century astrolabe to vaccines, electricity, and early aeronautics—and compare it to the use of analogy and precedent in U.S. courts, including the lawyer's ethical duty to inform the court of all relevant precedent.

LESSON 4

COUNTERWEIGHTS CONSIDERED: COMPETING VALUES AND EXEMPTIONS

Every legal system must reconcile fairness, equity, and broader ethical imperatives. In Jewish law, additional values such as human dignity, societal harmony, and family life play a decisive role. What happens when the technical application of the law conflicts with these overarching principles?

Like U.S. law, Jewish law provides a framework for leniencies, particularly in cases of competing considerations. This session examines responsa in which decisors departed from the majority interpretation of the law to grant exemptions, thereby fulfilling the deeper intent of the legal system.

LESSON 5

THE FIFTH FACTOR: EMOTIONAL AND SITUATIONAL WISDOM IN RABBINIC RESPONSA

Compassion in the law involves recognizing the human dimension behind legal disputes. At times, these considerations shape decisions that alleviate suffering and foster human flourishing within the bounds of the legal framework.

Responsa abound with examples of rabbis' profound sensitivity and discernment in addressing individual and communal needs with empathy

and wisdom. Affectionately known as the “Fifth Section” (the Shulchan Aruch's codification of Jewish law contains four formal sections), this domain highlights the common sense and emotional intelligence required of rabbinic judges.

Case studies from twelfth-century Yemen, seventeenth-century Poland, and early twentieth-century Russia illustrate how decisors considered not only facts but also underlying motivations, crafting rulings that were legally sound yet deeply compassionate.

LESSON 6

FORGING FORWARD:

EXPLORING FUTURISTIC RESPONSA

In the twenty-first century, as technology reshapes the world at dizzying speed, complex new legal questions arise.

This lesson explores both the ethics of using artificial intelligence in legal systems and contemporary responsa grappling with the tension between ancient ritual and modern life. Questions include: How does one observe the Sabbath in space? How should motherhood be defined in the context of mitochondrial transfer and ectogenesis? How should lab-grown meat be classified under kosher law?